

## On the number of isomorphic classes of nonnormal subgroups in a finite group.

By NOBORU ITÔ in Nagoya (Japan).

Let  $G$  be a finite group. Let  $r(G)$  be the number of isomorphic classes of nonnormal subgroups in  $G$  and let  $t(G)$  be the number of distinct prime factors of the order of  $G$ . Recently TROFIMOV [2]<sup>1)</sup> obtained the following results: (1) If  $r(G) < t(G) + 2$ , then  $G$  is soluble. (2) If  $r(G) < 7$ , then  $G$  is soluble. He remarked also the following: If  $A_5$  is the alternating group of degree 5, then  $r(A_5) = 2t(A_5) + 1 = 7$ .

In this note we shall prove the following theorem, which contains the results of TROFIMOV as a special case.

**Theorem.** *If  $G$  is insoluble and if  $r(G) < 2t(G) + 2$ , then  $G$  is isomorphic to  $A_5$ .*

**Proof.** We prove this theorem by an induction argument with respect to the order of the group.

(i)  $G$  contains no normal  $p$ -subgroup  $P$  which is distinct from a  $p$ -Sylow subgroup of  $G$ . In fact, otherwise, put  $\bar{G} = G/P$ . Then  $\bar{G}$  is insoluble and  $t(\bar{G}) = t(G)$ . If  $\bar{G}$  is not isomorphic to  $A_5$ , then  $\bar{G}$  contains at least  $2t(\bar{G}) + 2 = 2t(G) + 2$  classes of nonnormal subgroups, and a fortiori  $G$  does so. Thus  $\bar{G}$  is isomorphic to  $A_5$ . Then, as TROFIMOV remarked,  $\bar{G}$  contains seven classes of nonnormal subgroups. Let  $q$  be a prime factor of the order of  $G$  distinct from  $p$  and let  $Q$  be a  $q$ -Sylow subgroup of  $G$ . Then  $Q$  is nonnormal and does not contain  $P$ . Thus  $G$  contains at least eight classes of nonnormal subgroups. Since  $t(G) = 3$ , this is a contradiction.

(ii)  $G$  contains no normal  $p$ -Sylow subgroup  $P$ . In fact, otherwise, by SCHUR's theorem [3, p. 125], there exists a subgroup  $H$  of  $G$  such that  $G = PH$  and  $P \cap H = 1$ . Then  $H$  is insoluble and  $t(H) = t(G) - 1$ . If  $H$  is not isomorphic to  $A_5$ , then  $H$  contains at least  $2t(H) + 2 = 2t(G)$  classes of nonnormal subgroups. Let us consider the totality of products, each of

---

<sup>1)</sup> Though TROFIMOV uses the weaker notion "conjugate classes" in his paper [2], his proof remains valid under this stronger notion "isomorphic classes". Further the proof in the present paper does not hold under the notion "conjugate classes". The writer owes this suggestion to Professor RÉDEI and expresses his hearty thanks to him.

which is a product of any one of such subgroups of  $H$  with  $P$ . Then it occur new  $2t(G)$  classes of nonnormal subgroups of  $G$ . Since  $t(G) \geq 3$ , this is a contradiction. Thus  $H$  is isomorphic to  $A_5$ . As just above, we have at least fourteen classes of nonnormal subgroups of  $G$ . Since  $t(G) = 4$ , this is a contradiction. Thus  $G$  has  $t(G)$  classes of nonnormal Sylow subgroups.

(iii) Any  $p$ -Sylow subgroup  $P$  of  $G$  is not contained in the centre of its normalizer. In fact, otherwise, by BURNSIDE'S theorem [3; p. 133], there exists a normal subgroup  $H$  of  $G$  such that  $G = PH$  and  $P \cap H = 1$ . Then  $H$  is insoluble and  $t(H) = t(G) - 1$ . If  $H$  is not isomorphic to  $A_5$ , then  $H$  contains at least  $2t(H) + 2 = 2t(G)$  classes of nonnormal subgroups. Further there exist at least two distinct prime factors  $q, r$  of the order of  $H$  such that the corresponding Sylow subgroups  $Q, R$  are nonnormal in  $H$ . Let  $N(Q)$  and  $N(R)$  be the normalizers of  $Q$  and  $R$  in  $G$  respectively. Since  $H$  is normal in  $G$ , we have  $xQx^{-1} \subseteq H$  for every  $x \in G$ . Thus, by Sylow's theorem, there exists an element  $y \in H$  such that  $xQx^{-1} = yQy^{-1}$ . Then  $y^{-1}x \in N(Q)$ . This proves  $G = N(Q)H = N(R)H$ . By this and the normality of  $H$  one may assume that  $P \subset N(Q)$ . Since  $Q$  is the only one  $q$ -Sylow subgroup of  $PQ$ , if  $PQ$  is normal in  $G$ , the  $Q$  is normal in  $G$ . This contradicts either (i) or (ii). Hence the subgroups  $PQ$  and  $PR$  are nonnormal in  $G$ . Thus  $G$  contains at least  $2t(G) + 2$  classes of nonnormal subgroups, which is a contradiction. Thus  $H$  is isomorphic to  $A_5$ . Since  $H$  contains seven isomorphic classes of nonnormal subgroups and three nonnormal Sylow subgroups to the primes 2, 3, 5 we have, as just above, that  $G$  contains at least ten classes of nonnormal subgroups. Since  $t(G) = 4$ , this is a contradiction.

(iv) We consider any  $q$ -Sylow subgroup  $Q$  of  $G$ . Now let us assume that  $Q$  is abelian. Let  $N(Q)$  be the normalizer of  $Q$ . Then, from the fact just proved there exists at least one prime factor  $q'$  of the order of  $N(Q)$  such that for a corresponding Sylow subgroup  $Q'$  of  $N(Q)$  the product  $QQ'$  is not abelian. Clearly  $QQ'$  is nonnormal in  $G$ . Let us correspond to each prime factor  $q$  of the order of  $G$  either  $QQ'$  or a maximal subgroup  $Q_1$  of  $Q$  according as  $Q$  is abelian or not. Thus  $G$  has again  $t(G)$  classes of nonnormal subgroups.

(v) Let there exist a prime factor  $p$  of the order of  $G$  such that a corresponding Sylow subgroup  $P$  is not abelian. Let  $P_0$  be a subgroup of  $P$  of order  $p$ . Since  $P_0$  is nonnormal,  $G$  contains no class of nonnormal subgroups except that of  $P_0$  and the cases mentioned in (ii) and (iv). Therefore for every prime factor  $q$  of the order of  $G$ , distinct from  $p$ , a  $q$ -Sylow subgroup  $Q$  of  $G$  is of order  $q$ . If  $Q$  is normal in a subgroup  $H$  of  $G$  then  $H$  is in  $G$  nonnormal, for otherwise  $Q$  were normal in  $G$  and this is impossible. Consequently the order of every subgroup  $QQ'$  mentioned in (iv) is product of two primes. By virtue of (iii),  $p$  is the least prime factor of the order of  $G$ .

Assume that  $G$  contains two different  $p$ -Sylow subgroups,  $P$  and  $P'$ , with  $D = P \cap P' \neq 1$ . From all such  $D$ 's we choose a maximal one. The order of the normalizer  $N(D)$  of  $D$  in  $G$  is divisible by  $p^2q$  for some  $q$  and  $N(D)$  contains  $D$  as a characteristic subgroup [3; p. 102]. Since  $N(D)$  must be normal in  $G$ , so is  $D$  normal in  $G$  too. This is a contradiction. Therefore  $P \cap P' = 1$  for all  $P' \neq P$ . If the normalizer  $N(P)$  of  $P$  in  $G$  is equal to  $P$ , then by a well known theorem of FROBENIUS  $G$  contains a normal subgroup  $H$ , such that the factor group  $G/H$  is isomorphic to  $P$ . Hence  $G$  is soluble, and this yields a contradiction. Therefore  $N(P)$  contains  $P$  properly. If  $N(P)$  is normal in  $G$ , then  $P$  is also normal in  $G$  which is a contradiction. Then  $N(P)$  is nonnormal. This is again a contradiction. Thus every  $p$ -Sylow subgroup of  $G$  is abelian of order at most  $p^2$ . Now there exists just one prime factor  $p$  of the order of  $G$  such that a corresponding Sylow subgroup is of order  $p^2$ . In fact, if there exist no such prime factors, then  $G$  is soluble. If there exist two such prime factors, then  $G$  contains at least  $2t(G)+2$  classes of nonnormal subgroups, which is a contradiction. Further since  $G$  is insoluble,  $p$  should be equal to two.

(vi) Let  $M$  be any maximal subgroup of  $G$ . If  $M$  is normal in  $G$ , then  $M$  is of prime index  $q$  in  $G$  and therefore  $M$  is insoluble. Then  $q$  is not equal to two. Let  $Q$  be a  $q$ -Sylow subgroup of  $G$ . Then  $G = MQ$  and  $M \cap Q = 1$ . Then  $Q$  is contained in the centre of its normalizer, which contradicts (iii). Thus  $M$  is nonnormal and therefore  $M$  should be conjugate to some  $QQ'$  in (iv). Thus any non-maximal subgroup of  $G$  is abelian and  $G$  is simple. In other words,  $G$  is a simple group of Rédei type of even order. Thus by RÉDEI's theorem [1]  $G$  is isomorphic to  $A_5$ .

This completes the proof.

MATHEMATICAL INSTITUTE,  
NAGOYA UNIVERSITY.

### Literature.

- [1] RÉDEI, L., Ein Satz über die endlichen einfachen Gruppen, *Acta Math.*, **84** (1950), 129—153.
- [2] TROFIMOV, P. I., O vliyanií čísla vseh klassov neinvariantnykh sopryazhennykh podgrupp na svoistva konečnoi nespecial'noi gruppy, *Mat. sbornik*, **33** (75) (1953), 45—72.
- [3] ZASSENHAUS, H., *Lehrbuch der Gruppentheorie*. Bd. I (Berlin—Leipzig, 1937).

(Received March 29, in revised form June 2, 1954.)