

## Algebras intertwining compact operators

E. NORDGREN, M. RADJABALIPOUR, H. RADJAVI and P. ROSENTHAL

The main result of this note is that if  $\mathcal{A}$  is a norm-closed algebra of (bounded) operators on a (complex) Banach space  $\mathfrak{X}$ , if  $K$  is a nonzero compact operator on  $\mathfrak{X}$ , and if  $\mathcal{A}K=K\mathcal{A}$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  has a non-trivial (closed) invariant subspace. This is an extension of Lomonosov's theorem that every compact operator has a non-trivial hyperinvariant subspace. For injective compact operators we shall prove stronger results.

LOMONOSOV's result [4] quoted above implies that if  $AK=KA$  for every  $A$  in the algebra  $\mathcal{A}$ , then  $\mathcal{A}$  has invariant subspaces. It is very easy to construct uniformly closed algebras  $\mathcal{A}$  with  $\mathcal{A}K=K\mathcal{A}$  for some compact operator  $K$ , where  $\mathcal{A}$  has members not commuting with  $K$ . (See Remark (i) below.) In Section 2 we shall mention other contrasts with the case of Lomonosov's result.

In what follows  $\mathfrak{X}$  and  $\mathfrak{Y}$  will always denote Banach spaces,  $\mathcal{B}(\mathfrak{X})$  the algebra of all operators on  $\mathfrak{X}$ , and  $\mathcal{A}$  a subalgebra of  $\mathcal{B}(\mathfrak{X})$ ; subalgebras are not assumed to have identities.

**1. Main Results.** We start with the following lemma which may be of some independent interest. (See also Remark (iv) in Section 2.)

*Lemma 1. Let  $K$  be a compact operator on  $\mathfrak{X}$  and let  $S$  be any operator on  $\mathfrak{Y}$ . Let  $T$  be a bounded linear transformation of  $\mathfrak{Y}$  into  $\mathfrak{X}$  such that  $KTS=T$ . Then  $T$  has finite rank.*

*Proof.* Let  $C$  be the circle of radius  $r>0$  centered at the origin in the complex plane; assume that (i)  $r$  is sufficiently small so that  $1-\lambda S$  is invertible for  $\lambda$  inside  $C$ ; and (ii)  $C$  does not intersect the spectrum of  $K$ . Let  $P$  be the Riesz projection

$$P = \frac{1}{2\pi i} \int_C (K-\lambda)^{-1} d\lambda.$$

---

Received March 8, 1976.

Research supported by the National Science Foundation and the National Research Council.

(See, e.g., [7, p. 31].) We show that  $T\mathfrak{Y}$  is contained in the finite-dimensional space  $(1-P)\mathfrak{X}$ . Let  $y$  be any vector in  $\mathfrak{Y}$  and let  $x=Ty$ . Then, for  $\lambda$  inside  $C$ ,

$$Px = (K-\lambda)PTS(1-\lambda S)^{-1}y = (K_P-\lambda)PTS(1-\lambda S)^{-1}y,$$

where  $K_P=PK|P\mathfrak{X}$ .

Since  $\sigma(K_P)$  lies inside  $C$ , it follows that  $(K_P-\lambda)^{-1}Px$  has an analytic extension to the entire plane and thus  $Px=0$ . Hence  $x\in(1-P)\mathfrak{X}$ .

*Lemma 2. Let  $A$  and  $B$  be bounded linear transformations from  $\mathfrak{X}$  into  $\mathfrak{Y}$ . If  $A\mathfrak{X}\subseteq B\mathfrak{X}$  and if  $B$  is injective, then there exists an operator  $S$  on  $\mathfrak{X}$  such that  $A=BS$ .*

*Proof.* The proof given in [2] for a stronger theorem on Hilbert spaces works for this lemma also: just observe that  $B^{-1}A$  is a closed operator.

*Theorem 3. Let  $\mathcal{A}$  be a norm-closed subalgebra of  $\mathcal{B}(\mathfrak{X})$  and let  $K$  be an injective, non-quasinilpotent compact operator on  $\mathfrak{X}$  such that  $\mathcal{A}K\subseteq K\mathcal{A}$ . Then  $\mathcal{A}$  has a nonzero finite-dimensional invariant subspace.*

*Proof.* Assume, with no loss of generality, that there exists a nonzero  $x_0$  in  $\mathfrak{X}$  with  $Kx_0=x_0$ . Then  $\mathcal{A}x_0\subseteq K(\mathcal{A}x_0)$ . The linear manifold  $\mathcal{A}x_0$  of  $\mathfrak{X}$  is the range of the linear transformation  $T$  of  $\mathcal{A}$  (considered as a Banach space) into  $\mathfrak{X}$  defined by

$$T(A) = Ax_0.$$

Clearly  $T$  is bounded, and  $T(\mathcal{A})\subseteq KT(\mathcal{A})$ . Let  $\mathcal{A}_0$  be the null space of  $T$  and let  $\mathfrak{Y}$  be the quotient space  $\mathcal{A}/\mathcal{A}_0$ . Then  $\hat{T}\mathfrak{Y}\subseteq K\hat{T}\mathfrak{Y}$ , where  $\hat{T}$  is the induced injective linear transformation from  $\mathfrak{Y}$  into  $\mathfrak{X}$ . Since  $K$  is injective, so is  $K\hat{T}$ . Thus there exists, by Lemma 2, an operator  $S$  on  $\mathfrak{Y}$  with  $\hat{T}=K\hat{T}S$ . It follows from Lemma 1 that  $\hat{T}$  has finite rank. But

$$\hat{T}(\mathfrak{Y}) = T(\mathcal{A}) = \mathcal{A}x_0,$$

and thus  $\mathcal{A}x_0$  is a finite-dimensional invariant subspace for  $\mathcal{A}$ . (If  $\mathcal{A}x_0=0$ , then  $x_0$  generates a 1-dimensional invariant subspace.)

The following lemma is a special case of a result of FOIAŞ [3].

*Lemma 4. Let  $\mathcal{A}K\subseteq K\mathcal{A}$ , where  $\mathcal{A}$  is norm-closed and  $K$  is injective (and not necessarily compact). Then the map  $\varphi$  on  $\mathcal{A}$  defined by*

$$AK = K\varphi(A).$$

*is a continuous algebra homomorphism.*

**Proof.** The map  $\varphi$  is clearly a homomorphism. To prove that  $\varphi$  is continuous, it suffices to show that it is a closed map: if  $A = \lim A_n$  and  $B = \lim \varphi(A_n)$ , then

$$AK = \lim A_n K = \lim K\varphi(A_n) = KB,$$

and thus  $B = \varphi(A)$ .

**Theorem 5.** *Let  $\mathcal{A}K \subseteq K\mathcal{A}$ , where  $\mathcal{A}$  is norm-closed and  $K$  is injective, compact, and quasinilpotent. Then  $\mathcal{A}$  has a non-trivial invariant subspace.*

**Proof.** The main idea in the proof is that used in the simple, elegant proof given by H. M. HILDEN for Lomonosov's result quoted above (cf. [7], p. 165).

We start, as in Lomonosov's proof, by assuming with no loss of generality that  $\|K\| = 1$ , and that  $\mathcal{A}$  is transitive if possible. Fix  $x_0$  in  $\mathfrak{X}$  such that  $\|Kx_0\| > 1$  (and thus also  $\|x_0\| > 1$ ), and let  $\mathfrak{S}$  be the open ball of radius 1 centered at  $x_0$ . It follows from the transitivity of  $\mathcal{A}$  that the open sets  $A^{-1}(\mathfrak{S})$ ,  $A \in \mathcal{A}$ , cover  $\mathfrak{X} \setminus \{0\}$ , and thus they also cover the compact set  $\overline{K\mathfrak{S}}$ . Hence there is a finite subset  $\mathcal{F}$  of  $\mathcal{A}$  such that

$$\overline{K\mathfrak{S}} \subseteq \bigcup_{A \in \mathcal{F}} A^{-1}(\mathfrak{S}).$$

Let  $r = \max \{\|A\| : A \in \mathcal{F}\}$ . Given any positive integer  $n$ , one can inductively obtain  $A_1, \dots, A_n$  in  $\mathcal{F}$  such that

$$A_n K A_{n-1} K \dots A_2 K A_1 K x_0 \in \mathfrak{S}.$$

But, again by induction,

$$A_n K A_{n-1} K \dots A_2 K A_1 K = K^n \varphi(\dots (\varphi(\varphi(A_n) A_{n-1}) A_{n-2}) \dots A_1).$$

Therefore

$$\|A_n K A_{n-1} K \dots A_1 K\| \cong \|K^n\| \cdot \|\varphi\|^n \cdot r^n = \|(r\|\varphi\| \cdot K)^n\|.$$

Since  $r\|\varphi\|K$  is quasinilpotent, the vector  $A_n K \dots A_1 K x_0$  in  $\mathfrak{S}$  would be arbitrarily small for sufficiently large  $n$ . This contradicts the fact that  $\|x_0\| > 1$ . Thus  $\mathcal{A}$  cannot be transitive.

**Theorem 6.** *Let  $\mathcal{A}$  be a norm-closed subalgebra of  $\mathcal{B}(\mathfrak{X})$  which intertwines a nonzero compact operator. Then  $\mathcal{A}$  has a non-trivial invariant subspace.*

**Proof.** Let  $\mathcal{A}K = K\mathcal{A}$ , where  $K$  is compact and nonzero. If  $K$  is injective, the assertion follows from Theorems 3 and 5; otherwise the null space of  $K$  is a non-trivial subspace invariant under  $\mathcal{A}$ .

2. Remarks.

(i) Let  $\mathfrak{H}_1$  be a finite-dimensional subspace of the infinite-dimensional Hilbert space  $\mathfrak{H}$ . Let  $K_1$  be an invertible, non-scalar operator on  $\mathfrak{H}_1$ , and let  $K_2$  be an injective compact operator in  $\mathfrak{H} \ominus \mathfrak{H}_1$ . Let  $K = K_1 \oplus K_2$ , and let  $\mathcal{A} = \mathcal{B}(\mathfrak{H}_1) \oplus \mathcal{A}_2$ , where  $\mathcal{A}_2$  is the commutant of  $K_2$ . Then  $\mathcal{A}K = K\mathcal{A}$ , but not every member of  $\mathcal{A}$  commutes with  $K$ . (In this example  $\mathcal{A}$  is also weakly closed.)

A less trivial example can be constructed as follows. Let  $K$  be any nonzero compact operator on  $\mathfrak{H}$  and let  $\mathcal{A}$  be the weakly closed algebra of all operators of the form  $\begin{bmatrix} A & B \\ 0 & C \end{bmatrix}$  on  $\mathfrak{H} \oplus \mathfrak{H}$ , where  $A$  and  $C$  commute with  $K$  but  $B$  is arbitrary. Then  $\mathcal{A}$  intertwines the operator  $\begin{bmatrix} 0 & K \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$  but is not contained in the commutant of any nonscalar operator.

(ii) There are examples of  $\mathcal{A}$  and  $K$  as in Theorem 3 with  $\mathcal{A}K$  properly contained in  $K\mathcal{A}$ . Let  $\mathcal{A} = \mathcal{B}^*$ , where  $\mathcal{B}$  is the algebra of all analytic Toeplitz operators on a Hilbert space  $\mathfrak{H}$ , and represent  $\mathcal{A}$  as an algebra of uppertriangular matrices. Let  $K$  be the compact operator represented by a diagonal matrix  $\text{Diag}\{\lambda^n\}_{n=0}^\infty$  with  $|\lambda| < 1$ . Then it can be verified that  $\mathcal{A}K \subsetneq K\mathcal{A}$ .

(iii) In contrast with the case of Lomonosov’s Theorem, it is essential in our results that  $\mathcal{A}$  be closed. Let, for instance,  $\{e_i\}_{i=1}^\infty$  be an orthonormal basis for a Hilbert space  $\mathfrak{H}$ , and let  $\mathcal{A}$  be the algebra of all operators on  $\mathfrak{H}$  whose matrices relative to  $\{e_i\}_{i=1}^\infty$  have only finitely many nonzero entries. Then  $\mathcal{A}$  is clearly (topologically) transitive, but  $\mathcal{A}K = K\mathcal{A}$  for any injective operator (compact or not) whose matrix relative to  $\{e_i\}_{i=1}^\infty$  is diagonal.

(iv) Using properties of decomposable operators [1, pp. 30–31] one can prove another version of Lemma 1 as follows:

Lemma 1’. *Let  $K$  be a non-invertible, decomposable operator on  $\mathfrak{X}$  and let  $S$  be any operator on  $\mathfrak{Y}$ . Let  $T$  be a bounded linear transformation of  $\mathfrak{Y}$  into  $\mathfrak{X}$  such that  $KTS = T$ . Then the range of  $T$  is not dense in  $\mathfrak{X}$ .*

A corresponding version of Theorem 3 follows.

Theorem 3’. *Let  $\mathcal{A}$  be a norm-closed subalgebra of  $\mathcal{B}(\mathfrak{X})$  and let  $K$  be an injective, non-invertible, decomposable operator with a nonzero eigenvalue, such that  $\mathcal{A}K \subsetneq K\mathcal{A}$ . Then  $\mathcal{A}$  has a non-trivial invariant subspace.*

Lemma 1’ and Theorem 3’ remain true if “decomposable” is replaced by “hyponormal” or by “subspectral”. (Use [5, Lemma 1] and [6, Proposition 1].)

(v) We conjecture that if a norm-closed algebra  $\mathcal{A}$  leaves invariant the range

of a compact operator  $K$ , then it has a non-trivial invariant subspace. The hypothesis is equivalent to the inclusion  $\mathcal{A}K \subseteq K\mathcal{B}(\mathfrak{X})$ .

A weaker version of the conjecture is obtained by assuming  $\mathcal{A}$  to be closed in the strong operator topology. Validity of this version would follow from that of the transitive-algebra conjecture [7, p. 138]: every strongly closed transitive algebra of operators on  $\mathfrak{X}$  is  $\mathcal{B}(\mathfrak{X})$ .

### References

- [1] I. COLOJOARĂ and C. FOIAȘ, *The Theory of Generalized Spectral Operators*, Gordon Breach, Science Publ. (New York, 1968).
- [2] R. G. DOUGLAS, On majorization, factorization and range inclusion of operators in Hilbert space, *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.*, **17** (1966), 413—416.
- [3] C. FOIAȘ, Invariant para-closed subspaces, *Indiana Univ. Math. J.*, **21** (1972), 887—906.
- [4] V. J. LOMONOSOV, Invariant subspaces for operators commuting with compact operators, *Funct. Anal. Appl.*, **7** (1973), 55—56.
- [5] M. RADJABALIPOUR, On subnormal operators, *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.*, **211** (1975), 377—389.
- [6] M. RADJABALIPOUR, Ranges of hyponormal operators, *Illinois J. Math.*, to appear.
- [7] H. RADJAVI and P. ROSENTHAL, *Invariant Subspaces*, Springer-Verlag (Berlin—Heidelberg—New York, 1973).

(E. N.) UNIVERSITY OF NEW HAMPSHIRE  
(H. R.) DALHOUSIE UNIVERSITY  
(M. R. & P. R.) UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO